DataSHARE Peterborough

Meeting Minutes

November 13, 2018

Opening
The regular meeting of DataSHARE Peterborough was called to order by Nancy Fischer at 1pm on November 13, 2018 at the Peterborough County-City Paramedics' Boardroom (310 Armour Rd).

Present
Nancy Fischer – Senior Program Analyst, City of Peterborough
Caren Thayer – Data Analysis Coordinator, City of Peterborough
Tammy Sikma – Manager of GIS, County of Peterborough
Jane Hoffmeyer – Manager, Foundational Standards, Peterborough Public Health (PPH)
Andrew Bell – Labour Market Info Analyst, Workforce Development Board (WDB)
Lori Richey – Executive Director, Peterborough Family Health Team
Amanda Hiemstra – Quality Improvement Decision Support Specialist, Peterborough Family Health
Barb Znamirowski – Maps & Data Librarian, Trent University
Sarah Amirault –Researcher, Institutional Research Office, Fleming College

Regrets
Nicole Schleifer – Geomatics/Mapping Manager, City of Peterborough
Jennifer Chenier – Supervisor – Quality Initiatives, Kawartha-Haliburton Children's Aid Society
Brittany Wakefield – Crime Analyst, Peterborough Police Services
Mohamed Kharbouch – Epidemiologist, Peterborough Public Health (PPH)
Ellen Meadd – Manager, Projects & Community Engagement, Workforce Development Board (WDB)
Ellen Olsen-Lynch – Learning & Liaison Librarian, Trent University
Cheryl Stager – Program Support Partner, Peterborough Regional Health Centre
Team
Julia Wood – Business Development Lead – Business & Agriculture, Peterborough & the Kawarthas
Economic Development

Guests
n/a

Welcome and Introductions

Nancy welcomed the group and invited everyone to introduce themselves and their organization. The meeting's discussion focus was **"Closing the Knowledge to Action Gap."**

Review of Agenda & Previous Minutes

Jane has not yet received the RRFSS data. Presentation deferred to a future meeting.

Nancy to continue discussion with Northumberland about their interest in joining the Peterborough Data Consortium.

The agenda and previous minutes were received as presented.

Peterborough Data Consortium Sub-Committee Update

Nancy indicated that invoices would have been received by members. City has yet to formally transition governance from Peterborough Social Planning Council to City of Peterborough.

Northumberland County has expressed an interest in joining because they are not big enough to support their own Consortium. Nancy has spoken with key staff. The cost to add their population of approximately 85,000 would cost them $5,000 if they create their own sub-group. The population of Peterborough City & County is approximately 135,000 and costs us approximately $6,500. Membership is population based and adding Northumberland would increase our annual cost by $1,500 to $8,000. Nancy asked for the group's interests in defining pricing and participation.

- Lori indicated she would like to keep the Peterborough area costs stable and allow Northumberland to draw in new members to further cost share their portion.

Jane indicated that Haliburton-Kawartha-Pine Ridge (HKPR) District Health Unit might also be interested in participating.

> ACTION: Nancy to follow-up with HKPR District Health Unit.

The Community Data Program has been run by the Community Council for Social Development, but due to funding shortfalls, this is likely to transition to the Canadian Community Economic Development Network.

ICount Peterborough

Presenters: Lisa Smith, Director, Philanthropic Impact, United Way
Dorothy Olver, Program Mgr, Homelessness & Addiction Services, Peterborough City

Dorothy summarized that in 2016 the Federal government began funding United Way agencies across Canada to conduct counts to determine how many people are homeless within a 24-hour period. In 2018, the funding was made available again. The Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing (MAH) has legislated that a count be required.

Local methodology and practices have improved as the organizers get more adept at collecting data. A pre-defined methodology has been used that was developed in other communities (e.g., Toronto, New York). Staff & volunteers interacted with Peterborough's homeless through discussions.

Extensive screening & training was conducted prior to the count. Many volunteers came away from this experience having learned a great deal about their community. Debriefing was provided in order to help surveyors deal with difficult stories they heard. In an effort to screen out bias, every person that surveyors met on the street was asked the same question, "Are you homeless?"

There are multiple enumeration methods accepted by the MAH. The Point in Time (PiT) count and Registry Week methods are employed locally. Although the methods are distinct, in 2018 the collections were combined with PiT survey questions incorporated into a more extensive survey. The purpose was to know the homeless population "by name" and a By Name List was produced. Each individual was given a ranked vulnerability score with the highest ranking indicating the person facing the greatest immediate risk. Resources are then triaged as they became available to address the greatest needs first.

In 2018, a greater effort was made to get out into the County, but there was limited engagement. Many people didn't know the volunteers were in their communities collecting data at the time of the count and were therefore missed.

In 2016, community advocates pushed back against the invasiveness of the survey questions, but it was found that many in the homeless community actually wanted to share their stories so that it could be ended.

The weather is believed to have affected the results. In 2016, the weather was cold, sleeting & snowing which tended to limit the numbers found in public places, whereas in 2018 it was mild and beautiful with many people out and about.

A "Youth Magnet" event (e.g., haircuts, manicures, etc) was conducted at YES (Youth Emergency Shelter) that attracted 40 youth who would not have been captured otherwise. Organizers also tried to conduct an "Indigenous Magnet" event, but weren't able to pull both together in time for this count. They will continue to explore partnerships with indigenous community agencies for a future count.

In 2018, surveyors tried to use tablets to feed data directly into a centralized enterprise database. Peterborough was the 1st community to try working paperless, however it was not found to be effective as the inputting was deemed too slow and the experience less personal. Organizers are open to attempting this method again with an improved strategy in the future.

A planning table was created with members from agencies involved in the homelessness sector locally. Caren Thayer, City of Peterborough's Data Analysis Coordinator, was involved in 2018 as a data analyst. The City also involved their graphic designer to interpret the data and develop the intuitive infographics found in the report.

All of the factors above seemed to contribute to higher results in 2018. Whereas there were approximately 100 homeless in 2016, 259 (142 – absolute; 94 – provisional; 23 – unknown) were recorded as homeless in 2018. The key identifiable communities discovered in 2018 included: youth, aboriginal, veterans. Organizers will be working to ensure that veterans are made aware of the many supports that exist specifically for them.

Among the many noteworthy results of the PiT were the following:
- Top 3 reasons for homelessness were found to be family breakdown – 30%; unsafe housing – 22% (e.g., rooming houses with mould, fire code violations); and addiction/substance use – 17%. The top barrier to finding housing was that rents are too high.

- Stats indicated that a notable portion of the local homeless population are well educated:
    - 2% hold a Masters or Ph.D degree,

- o   11% hold a post-secondary degree or diploma, and
- o   9% have some level of experience in a post-secondary institution.

- When asked about migration, only 30% of participants responded about where they came from. Many were from the City & County, although there were some from Hasting, Kawartha Lakes, Durham, Northumberland or beyond. There was one story of an individual who came from Windsor because he saw on the web site he could get intensive case management support to find housing. Unfortunately, at present, the supports exist but there is no housing available.

Results from 2018 have been shared through two data launches – one preliminary and a second with final results, via the City and United Way web sites, and more. The final report is being shared widely with unique, anonymized survey results are being shared only among the participating organizing agencies, subject to participant agreement. The consent form, vetted through legal & Clerks office, has changed numerous times to identify who the data can be shared with.

The federal government administers HIFIS (Homeless Individuals and Families Information System) in order to create a national portrait of homelessness. This centralized database collects information by emergency shelter staff and is able to determine the movement of people from shelter to shelter by asking, "Where did you come from?" There are still some struggles sharing data. It would be incredibly beneficial to the various service providers who support Peterborough's homeless population to find a means of sharing data meaningfully.

Year in Review and Looking Forward

Nancy reminded the group that this is the end of the 2nd calendar year it has existed. The discussion themes & foci of 2018's meetings were reviewed. Nancy also reviewed the objectives of the Terms of Reference and asked what members felt were the areas of strength & growth.

Objectives

1. To collaborate as data specialists in order to better understand local City and County of Peterborough statistics.
2. To monitor trends and create essential community documents and reports
3. To coordinate projects involving local data in order to maximize our capacity.
4. To share local analyses so that work on local statistics is not duplicated.
5. To develop processes for the sharing of local data.
6. To share in the cost of the data for the Peterborough Data Consortium (PDC).

Strengths:
-   Objectives 1, 4, 6
Areas for Growth:
-   Objective 5 – developing processes for sharing of local data
    - o   How can we share manipulated, rolled up data results among members?
    - o   Any data that would be shared among members should be at an anonymized level such that it could be shared openly, if any organization had an Open Data strategy in place.
    - o   Neither the City nor County have fully adopted an Open Data program yet.

- o Just because we could share data, we need to be careful about deciding whether it would be advisable to do so (e.g., to prevent predatory practices on vulnerable communities)
  - o Managing data sharing differently depending on source
    - Member-owned data within DataSHARE
      - E.g., Could Trent/Fleming be able to access all DataSHARE data
    - Data Consortium data only within members
  - o Trent/Fleming would benefit from knowing what types of analyses the community would like to see conducted.
  - o There is an interest in learning from other communities where there might already be good processes in place

    ACTION: NANCY to inquire with CDP about other communities' practices during upcoming teleconference.

- - Objective 4 – sharing local analyses to reduce duplication
    - o Develop working group to prioritize census data analyses agreed upon by the group

- - Desire for an opportunity for DataSHARE to discuss what data we hold, what we can share, and what we need
    - o Data Cataloging exercise to take place in Q1 2019
    - o Research & development of data sharing agreements & file storage options - 2019
    - o Identified resources included:
      - Trent's Graduate Theses & Dissertations: http://digitalcollections.trentu.ca/islandora/object/tula%3Aetd
      - Trent
        - General areas of study in various departments at Trent
        - Key research priorities over the coming 5 years?
        - Focus areas for upcoming NSERC / SSHRC grants
      - Ptbo Family Health Teams – ages,
      - WDB – Data Neuron exports can be shared in PDF form, but not Word/Excel

    ACTION: DataSHARE to catalogue data holdings in each organization

    ACTION: DataSHARE to develop processes (legal agreements, transfer methods) for data sharing among members

Meeting Calendar for 2019 – Dates and Presentations

- - Dates for 2019, locations TDB:
    - o Feb 5, 2019
    - o May 7, 2019
    - o Sept 10, 2019
    - o Nov 5, 2019

Round Table
Nancy asked the group to share ideas related to the day's discussion focus, specifically: "Where do you see gaps between data that you have and ways it could be used?"

- Andrew Bell, WDB
  - Funding future uncertain after March 2019
  - Currently focused on 5 projects:
    - Highlighting top industries
    - Entrepreneurship guide
    - Succession planning
    - E-guides for employers
    - Experiential learning
  - Work to represent 5 municipalities (Northumberland, City of Peterborough, Peterborough County, Haliburton, Kawartha Lakes)
  - Over 220 data requests in 2018 year-to-date
    - E.g., # skilled tradespeople in the area; demand for services based on job postings
    - Wage Shadow:
      - Wage comparisons by 5 data points for each occupation WDB lists (locally, Toronto, provincially, nationally, __)
      - For some jobs we pay more than other centres
      - For some jobs we pay less for
  - There are worker shortages expected
    - 11,000 fewer people in the 15-19 age bracket (entering workforce) than in the 60-64 bracket (soon to retire)
  - Federal loan forgiveness program exists for nurses/doctors practicing in rural areas
- Jane Hoffmeyer, PPH
  - RRFSS (Rapid Risk Factor Surveillance System) project ongoing, results anticipated
  - Working on annual program planning that will commence in Oct/Nov (E.g., EGAD)
- Caren Thayer, City of Peterborough DAC
  - Working on 1st 5-year plan for Early Learning
  - Social Risk Index mapping project (with City mapping services)
    - Each map will show City & County together on a page
    - Social Risk Index being calculated
      - Scored on a scale of 0-9
        - Neighbourhoods with 9 had scores higher than provincial average on all 9 census variables
        - Score of 0 indicates results lower on all 9 census variables
      - Calculated from 9 variables of 2016 census using previous methodology that couldn't be reliably applied using 2011 census
        - Education – (% aged 25-64 who do not have their high school diploma)
        - Employment – (% unemployed)
        - Income – (% of households that are below the Low Income Measurement After Tax or LIM-AT)
        - Reliance on government-subsidized incomes – (% of income that is comprised of government transfers)
        - Housing – (% of homes requiring major repair)
        - Family structure – (% of families who are led by a lone parent)
        - Mobility – (% of families who moved in the past year)
        - Language – (% who do not speak either official language - English or French)
        - Immigration (% of recent immigrants)

- Currently completing printed maps, working to add more layers that will be available to internal Social Services Case Managers
- Nancy Fischer, City of Peterborough Social Services
  - Highlights report for Four Counties for Kids
    - Pulling together data on children <18 yrs
    - Kinark has completed the analysis (census summaries, etc)
    - Data from Ministry of Finance population forecasts and Census,
- Tammy Sikma, County of Peterborough
  - Spoke to usefulness of field collection tools like ArcGIS Survey 123 (questions & location) or Collector (drop-down selections) apps
  - Indicated that Esri has an online tool capable of disseminating Open Data
- Barb Znamirowski, Trent University
  - Working to build her team in order to respond to needs
  - To be involved with Child & Youth Planning Team
  - Rethinking local surveillance of cannabis data
    - Trying to better support local cannabis inquiries
      - E.g., harms, use, access, perceptions
  - Recently relocating into the new Library building
  - Offering to host a meeting in the new Library
    - New data visualization mapping tools (spatial & statistical data visualization)
    - Could invite the Health research group to participate
- Sarah Amirault, Fleming College
  - A lot of the work produced doesn't go out broadly
  - Key Performance Indicator (KPI) survey results are just being compiled
    - Used in program review processes to evaluate
  - Ramping up efforts to examine predictive analytics
    - Working with Mohawk College to explore factors to understand which students are at greatest risk of leaving school early
    - Results are not program specific
    - Would like to better understand distance from campus of respondents (mapping?)
- Lori Richey, Peterborough Family Health Team (FHT)
  - Peterborough FHT member of Sub-Region Planning Table
    - Table is a result of Patients First
    - Ptbo City & County is a sub-region
    - Includes reps from social services, mental health, housing, indigenous
  - Estimate about 8,000 people without a physician currently
  - Need to understand population growth estimates
  - Ratio of 2 : 1 to replace retiring doctors, largely due to work-life balance requirements
  - Packaging up patient lists for prospective new physicians to build a practice around
  - Developing a community survey to capture barriers to medical services (e.g., childcare, models of care that resonate or don't
  - How to reach people who don't resonate with traditional care? Mobile bus?
  - Gathering information about local prevalence of disease
  - Integration of care coordination & system coordination
    - E.g., wound-care, housing
- Focusing on practices that can help to reduce tax-payer expenditures
  - E.g., installing audio-video telecommunications in remote communities to physicians in Toronto could:
    - Take less time away from work for patient

- Incur lower travel / accommodations costs
  - Seeking data that will support these interests
    - E.g., cost of an average ambulance response

Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 3:14pm. The next meeting will be held from **1-3pm on February 5, 2019**, location to be determined.

Minutes submitted by: Tammy Sikma