

THE CORPORATION OF THE CITY OF PETERBOROUGH

BY-LAW NUMBER 03-094

BEING A BY-LAW TO AUTHORIZE THE EXECUTION OF AN AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE CORPORATION OF THE CITY OF PETERBOROUGH AND HENDERSON RECREATION EQUIPMENT LTD FOR THE SUPPLY AND INSTALLATION OF PLAYSTRUCTURES AT FOUR PARKS: KAWARTHA HEIGHTS, TURNER, NORTHLAND AND KING EDWARD – PROPOSAL P-09-03.

THE CORPORATION OF THE CITY OF PETERBOROUGH BY THE COUNCIL THEREOF HEREBY ENACTS AS FOLLOWS:

1. That the Mayor and Clerk be and they are hereby authorized to execute an agreement between the Corporation of the City of Peterborough and Henderson Recreation Equipment in the form attached hereby as Schedule “A”, and to affix the Seal of the Corporation thereto.

By-law read a first and second time this 2nd day of June, 2003

By-law read a third time and finally passed this 2nd day of June, 2003

(Sgd.) Sylvia Sutherland, Mayor

(Sgd.) Nancy Wright-Laking, City Clerk

SCHEDULE “A”

PURPOSE

A report to propose the award of Proposal P-09-03 for the Supply and Installation of replacement playstructures at four parks: Kawartha Heights, Turner, Northland and King Edward.

RECOMMENDATION

That City Council award Contract P-09-03 for the Supply and Installation of Four Playstructures to Henderson Recreation Equipment Ltd., 11 Gilbertson Drive, Simcoe, Ontario N3Y 4K8, in the amount of \$79,472.54 which includes \$5,199.14 G.S.T.

BUDGET AND FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The budget for the purchase of the four playstructures is included in the approved 2003 Capital Budget. All four playstructures will replace existing playstructures. Funds for the maintenance of these playstructures is included in the approved 2003 Public Works Operating Budget.

BACKGROUND

In 2002, Public Works completed an evaluation of all playstructures found in 54 park locations throughout the municipality. Using data from the evaluation including age distribution, the Board of Parks and Recreation made a recommendation to City Council for program funding to achieve the sustained performance of a wide distribution of playstructures in municipal parks. Priority for replacement playstructures identified three park areas for the 2003 Public Works Capital Budget. The three park areas included: Kawartha Heights, Turner and Weller Crescent.

In addition to this program, the Recreation Division made recommendation for funding in the 2003 Capital Budget through the Community Assistance Program to augment local fundraising initiatives directed to park improvement. The Board of Parks and Recreation prioritized King Edward and Northland parks for Community Assistance to support local fundraising efforts to replace existing playstructures in these parks.

To move these programs forward, proposals were invited for the replacement of four playstructures at Kawartha Heights, Turner, Northland and King Edward. (The replacement of the playstructure at Weller Crescent involves swings and slide only and due to cost will be undertaken by direct purchase of this equipment.)

Four bid submissions were received as follows:

Bidders	Cost (before G.S.T.) (\$)	G.S.T. (\$)	Total Cost (\$)
Little Tikes Commercial Play Systems	52,687.25	3,688.11	56,375.36
Henderson Recreation Equipment Ltd.	74,273.40	5,199.14	79,472.54
Belair Recreation	76,451.83	5,351.63	81,803.46
ABC Recreation	104,671.89	7,327.03	111,998.92

In addition to the bid price, the proposal call outlines the criteria on which a contract for supply and installation will be awarded. The proposal call states the award will be based upon:

- Design
- Site amenity values
- Play elements
- Quality of Materials and Durability
- Resistance of Components to Vandalism
- Safety and Ergonomics
- Ability of proponent to complete installation within six (6) weeks
- Warranty
- Availability of Replacement Parts
- Incorporation of Minimum Design Elements as specified
- Price
- Qualifications(s) and experience of the installer.

The Park Development Sub Committee of the Board of Parks and Recreation met to review Proposal Call P-09-03. The Committee reviewed all submission's in great detail. All Proponents met the minimum standards established in the RFP with respect to the play elements included in their submission. The Committee then looked beyond minimum elements and reviewed the submissions based upon design, durability and cost. The Committee determined that the recommended proponent must provide a playstructure that is both appealing to neighbourhood children, provide a safe, long lasting playground for their use and provide the highest relative value. In this respect, the Committee focused attention on the two lowest cost proposals. The Committee found distinct differences between the two suppliers.

With respect to materials specified in the submissions, Henderson provided an 11 gauge metal tube, whereas Little Tikes provided a 13 gauge vertical support tube size. The Committee preferred the heavier 11 gauge vertical supports. There are several Henderson structures throughout the municipal park system constructed with the 11 gauge tubing. Some of these structures exceed 12 years in age and have proven to be durable and long lasting.

The Committee then reviewed deck size. The deck on a play structure is the horizontal platform that is reached from each climbing stage (stairs, ladder, etc.). The deck size on the Henderson model as submitted provided a 48 inch square, while the deck size on the Little Tikes model provided a 40 inch square. The Committee preferred the larger deck size as it will accommodate more children on the structure.

Another element reviewed by the Committee was layout and distribution of the play elements. The RFP provided location maps for equipment at Northland Park, King Edward Park, Kawartha Heights Park and Turner Park. Each location had limitations where equipment could be sited in the park and these locations were different from park to park. Little Tikes provided one playstructure design for all four parks. Henderson, however, reviewed the site requirements and presented four unique structures in layout format for each of the park sites. They also showed how each of these structures could fit the locations identified.

Finally, the Committee rated the play elements. Henderson not only met the minimum elements, but added creative play features. As an example, to go from one level to another, traditional means are stairs and ladders. Little Tikes used both of these; Henderson did as well but also included a small rock climbing element as an alternative means to get to a new level. The play value of the rock climbing wall far outweighs traditional steps and ladders. In addition Henderson provided a spiral slide design which in the opinion of the Committee, presented a higher play value than the wave slide offered in the Little Tikes submission.

In summary, the combination of heavier gauge tubing, larger platforms, and more creative designs made Henderson Recreation Equipment Ltd. the unanimous choice by the Committee.

Following the recommendation from the Parks Development Sub Committee, the following budget disbursement was prepared to allocate costs to this project.

Public Works Capital Budget (2003)

Park	Unit Cost as Bid (\$)	Removal of Existing Structure Site Rehabilitation Construction of the Safety Surface (\$)	Sub Total (\$)
Kawartha Heights	19,868	8,200	28,068
Turner Park	19,868	7,800	27,668
Weller Crescent	5,949	7,700	13,649
Total	45,685	23,700	69,385

Public Works Capital Budget Balance \$90,000 - \$69,385 = \$20,615

Recreation Division – Capital Budget (2003)

Park	Unit Cost as Bid \$	Removal of Existing Structure Site Rehabilitation Construction of the Safety Surface \$	Fundraising \$	Sub Total \$
King Edward	19,868	8,200	(5,000)	23,068
Northland	19,868	7,700	(5,000)	22,568
Total	39, 736	15,900	(10,000)	45,636

Recreation Division Capital Budget Balance \$50,000 - \$45,636 = \$4,364

When reviewing the program recommended by the Parks Board for the sustained provision of playstructures in municipal parks, City Council recognized the benefit of a three stage plan. Part A involved the replacement of existing playstructures, Part B involved the removal of playstructures on the recommendation from the Board of Parks and Recreation, where play opportunity was provided in a nearby park location, and Part C involved the rehabilitation of existing playstructures. In this respect, funds from the Public Works Capital Budget not required for the purchase of playstructures as bid in proposal P-09-03 will be directed to rehabilitation activity at existing playgrounds.

SUMMARY

Based on review by the Parks Development Sub Committee of the Board of Parks and Recreation, it is recommended that Proposal P-09-03 be awarded to Henderson Recreation Equipment Ltd. for the supply and installation of playstructures at four parks: Kawartha Heights, Turner, Northland and King Edward.

Gerry Rye, P. Eng.
Director, Utility Services Department

Peter Southall
Manager, Public Works Division